Getting The Most From Your Hotline Helpline Program

Leveraging the Data to Gain Key Insights into Your Organizational Culture

Joseph Agins, CCEP, CECM, CFE
Institutional Compliance Officer, Sam Houston State University

Learning Objectives

• How your helpline program data can help you to understand the ethical culture of your institution

• Using the data to zero-in on hotspots and stamp out fires before they get too big

• Benchmarking your results against the industry to measure success and identify areas for improvement
ABC Widgets, Inc.

- Fortune 1000
- 25,000 employees
- Houston, TX
- 4th largest widget producer in the country
- They do have an E&C program and a helpline
- We have access to some limited helpline data

Overall Report Volume

- Are people using the helpline?
- If so, to what extent?
- If not, why?
- Research and track anomalies
ABC Widgets, Inc.

**Total Helpline Reports Received**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reports</td>
<td>156</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>263</td>
<td>187</td>
<td>295</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Report Rate per 100 Employees**

- Volume per 100 Employees
  - If your organization has 25,000 employees and you receive 500 reports, this would equate to 2 out of every 100 employees reporting
  - \( \frac{500}{25,000} \times 100 = 2 \)
  - When compared to the benchmark we see that this institution receives more reports than the average. What might this mean?
- No or few reports at all
  - Why this is important?
ABC Widgets, Inc.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Report Rate</th>
<th>FY2015</th>
<th>FY2016</th>
<th>FY2017</th>
<th>FY2018</th>
<th>Benchmark</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Benchmark source: Navex Global 2017 Ethics & Compliance Hotline & Incident Management Benchmark Report

Substantiation Rate

- The benchmark average is 40% substantiated
- A higher substantiation rate can mean:
  - You are receiving a higher quality of reports from reporters
  - You have well trained investigators who are conducting better and/or more thorough investigations
- Below average numbers may indicate problems with one or both of the above or:
  - Maybe your program has not been socialized well or is in need of a refresh
  - Maybe there is an issue of improper use by employees
  - Maybe your investigative staff is in need of training
  - Maybe there is too much pressure being placed on speed as opposed to quality
  - Maybe you don’t have a good e-forensics team
ABC Widgets, Inc.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Disposition</th>
<th>FY2015</th>
<th>FY2016</th>
<th>FY2017</th>
<th>FY2018</th>
<th>Benchmark</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Substantiated</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unsubstantiated</td>
<td>47%</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>46%</td>
<td>51%</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Benchmark source: Navex Global 2015 Ethics & Compliance Hotline Benchmark Report

Reports vs. Inquiries

- Depends on how your particular program is set up
- Are your employees using the hotline to report allegations or ask questions?
- The cross-industry benchmark is 80/20 with 80% being reports
- The hotline (helpline) can be a very powerful and even more effective tool if it is also used as an avenue for employees to go to for help
ABC Widgets, Inc.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason for Contact</th>
<th>FY2015</th>
<th>FY2016</th>
<th>FY2017</th>
<th>FY2018</th>
<th>Benchmark</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reporting a violation, allegation or concern of wrong-doing</td>
<td>98%</td>
<td>95%</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>88%</td>
<td>80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Question or request for guidance</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>12%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Benchmark source: Navex Global 2015 Ethics & Compliance Hotline Benchmark Report

Anonymity Rate

- The benchmark average is approximately 70/30
- Why do employees choose to report anonymously?
  - Do not want to be a snitch
  - Do not want to get involved
  - Fear of retaliation
  - Feel their report may not be handled confidentially
  - Do not understand and/or have confidence in the investigative process
  - Assume nothing will be done and reporting is just a waste of time

- **Employee Trust**
### ABC Widgets, Inc.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Report Type</th>
<th>FY2015</th>
<th>FY2016</th>
<th>FY2017</th>
<th>FY2018</th>
<th>Benchmark</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Anonymous</td>
<td>23%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>61%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Named Reporter</td>
<td>77%</td>
<td>78%</td>
<td>82%</td>
<td>84%</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Benchmark source: Navex Global 2015 Ethics & Compliance Hotline Benchmark Report*

### Reporter Follow-up to Anonymous Reports

- Follow-ups are critical for us to adequately understand and/or investigate the report.
- The benchmark shows only 30% of these reporters call back.
- If you are over 30% what are you doing as we all want to know?
- If well under the average why might this be?
  - Poor, inconsistent messaging about hotline program and how it works
  - Slow, delayed and inadequate acknowledgements
  - Could be a red-flag indicator with respect to culture
ABC Widgets, Inc.

**Median Follow-Up Rate to Anonymous Reports**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>FY2015</th>
<th>FY2016</th>
<th>FY2017</th>
<th>FY2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Phone</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>30%</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Web Submission</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Methods</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Intranet, mail, email, walk-in

**Why is this information important?**

- Phone
- Web Submission
- Other Methods – Intranet, mail, email, walk-in
- Why is this information important?
### ABC Widgets, Inc.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reporting Method</th>
<th>FY2015</th>
<th>FY2016</th>
<th>FY2017</th>
<th>FY2018</th>
<th>Benchmark</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Helpline - Phone</td>
<td>45%</td>
<td>49%</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>32%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helpline – Web Submission</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>20%</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other – Intranet, phone, fax, email, walk-in</td>
<td>31%</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Benchmark source: Navex Global 2015 Ethics & Compliance Hotline Benchmark Report*

### Report Source

Where are your reports coming from?

- Employees
- Customers
- Vendors
- Other outside parties
ABC Widgets, Inc.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employee</td>
<td>91%</td>
<td>89%</td>
<td>87%</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>91%</td>
<td>94%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Benchmark source: 2006 Survey of Ethics & Compliance Officer Association (ECOA) Sponsoring Partner Members

Report Type

- Standard allegation categories
  - Accounting, Auditing & Financial Reporting
  - Business Integrity
  - HR, Diversity and Workplace Respect
  - Environment, Health and Safety
  - Misuse, Misappropriation of Corporate Assets
- More specific breakdowns based on your needs/industry
  - Clery Act violations
  - FERPA
  - Title IX
  - Athletics Compliance
ABC Widgets, Inc.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Report Type</th>
<th>FY2016 (597 total)</th>
<th>FY2017 (634 total)</th>
<th>FY2018 (845 total)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Accounting or Auditing Practices</td>
<td>7 (1%)</td>
<td>2 (&lt;1%)</td>
<td>4 (&lt;1%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conflict of Interest</td>
<td>30 (5%)</td>
<td>9 (1%)</td>
<td>11 (1%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discrimination</td>
<td>12 (2%)</td>
<td>14 (2%)</td>
<td>20 (2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Health &amp; Safety</td>
<td>4 (&lt;1%)</td>
<td>6 (&lt;1%)</td>
<td>2 (&lt;1%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gifts</td>
<td>6 (1%)</td>
<td>3 (&lt;1%)</td>
<td>9 (1%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Harassment</td>
<td>58 (10%)</td>
<td>13 (2%)</td>
<td>12 (1%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misuse of Resources</td>
<td>36 (6%)</td>
<td>31 (5%)</td>
<td>14 (2%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retaliation</td>
<td>7 (1%)</td>
<td>6 (&lt;1%)</td>
<td>4 (&lt;1%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theft</td>
<td>2 (&lt;1%)</td>
<td>3 (&lt;1%)</td>
<td>3 (&lt;1%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sanction Type

For those cases that are substantiated, what is the severity? What types of sanctions are being levied?

- Coaching/Verbal Warning
- Discussion Memo
- Written Warning
- Termination
ABC Widgets, Inc.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sanction</th>
<th>FY2015</th>
<th>FY2016</th>
<th>FY2017</th>
<th>FY2018</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Termination</td>
<td>31 (11%)</td>
<td>22 (9%)</td>
<td>13 (7%)</td>
<td>26 (10%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Written Warning</td>
<td>71 (25%)</td>
<td>48 (20%)</td>
<td>27 (16%)</td>
<td>25 (19%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussion Memo</td>
<td>154 (54%)</td>
<td>136 (57%)</td>
<td>109 (63%)</td>
<td>81 (60%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coaching</td>
<td>31 (11%)</td>
<td>33 (14%)</td>
<td>25 (14%)</td>
<td>31 (12%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Case Closure Time

- Benchmark average is 42 days
- Typically 30-45 days is seen as a reasonable time frame
- The longer it takes the more opportunity for a negative impact for all involved
- Longer time frames can erode trust in the system/program and ultimately quell future reporting

Benchmark source: Navex Global 2017 Ethics & Compliance Hotline & Incident Management Benchmark Report
Thoughts about ABC Widgets Culture?

- Are employees and/or others aware of and using the helpline?
- Are quality helpline reports being received?
- Are employees seeking help with E&C questions?
- Do employees have confidence in the organization/process that reports will be handled confidentially?
- Are employees concerned about retaliation?
- Are investigations handled and managed effectively?
- Are issues being spotted and addressed?
Benchmarking Sources

• SCCE Compliance Effectiveness Survey
• Navex E&C Hotline & Incident Management Benchmark Report
  • 12,500 Global Clients
  • World’s largest database of reports
  • 5,132 clients using hotline and/or incident management system
  • 38.5 million employees total
  • Generate nearly 1 million reports per year
  • Covering 26 industries and 45 sub-industries
• ECI’s Global Benchmark on Workplace Ethics Report
• LRN Ethics & Compliance Program Effectiveness Report
• Your own past performance

Some Best Practices to Consider

• Use a good case management system
• Measure, track and report
• Keep it simple
• Use multiple benchmarking sources if possible
• Survey employee perceptions of your Helpline program
• Do periodic quality control check-ups
• Make sanitized results available to employees
• Learn and share best practices!
Questions? Thoughts? Ideas?

Thank You!

Joseph Agins, CCEP, CECM, CFE
Institutional Compliance Officer | Adjunct Professor White-Collar Crime
Sam Houston State University | Huntsville, TX 77341
P: 936-294-2671 | C: 602-330-4679 | E: jxa101.shsu.edu